

**MINUTES OF THE  
PRIVATELY OWNED HEALTH CARE ORGANIZATION TASK FORCE**

Monday, November 13, 2006 – 1:30 p.m. – Room W135 House Building

**Members Present:**

Sen. Michael G. Waddoups, Senate Chair  
Rep. David Clark, House Chair  
Speaker Greg J. Curtis  
Sen. Gene Davis  
Sen. John W. “Bill” Hickman  
Rep. Patricia W. Jones  
Rep. Bradley G. Last  
Sen. Mark B. Madsen  
Sen. Ed Mayne  
Rep. Jackie Biskupski  
Rep. Stephen D. Clark  
Rep. Brad L. Dee  
Rep. James A. Dunnigan  
Rep. Rebecca D. Lockhart

**Members Absent:**

Sen. Peter C. Knudson

**Staff Present:**

Ms. Constance C. Steffen, Policy Analyst  
Ms. Allison Morgan, Policy Analyst  
Ms. Patricia Owen, Associate General Counsel  
Ms. Joy L. Miller, Legislative Secretary

**Note:** A list of others present, a copy of related materials, and an audio recording of the meeting can be found at [www.le.utah.gov](http://www.le.utah.gov).

**1. Task Force Business**

Chair Waddoups called the meeting to order at 1:50 p.m. Sen. Knudson was excused from the meeting.

**MOTION:** Sen. Hickman moved to approve the minutes of the October 16, 2006 meeting. The motion passed unanimously. Sen. Madsen and Rep. Dee were absent for the vote.

**2. Task Force Summary Report**

Ms. Steffen indicated that the report deals with the work of the Task Force in the current year. The work done in 2005 was reported in the preliminary report which is attached as Appendix A.

Chair Waddoups referred to the statement of Mr. David Argue, Economists, Inc., regarding choices among health insurance products available to consumers in Cache and Washington counties being similar to the types of alternatives available along the Wasatch Front. He felt the statement, included on page 3 of the report, left the impression that the competition overall is the same in those two counties as in the other counties in the state. Chair Waddoups indicated there are no conclusions or recommendations included in the report. He distributed and discussed "Conclusion to Privately Owned Health Care Organization Task Force Final Report: Option #3."

Sen. Davis pointed out that there are unanswered questions that remain regarding the healthcare system. He noted that transparency is an issue that should be addressed in legislation. The Task Force should encourage the Legislature to continue to look at health care and access to health care.

Chair Wadoups distributed and reviewed "Conclusion to Privately Owned Health Care Organization Task Force Final Report: Option #2."

The Task Force discussed the options presented by Chair Waddoups.

Chair Waddoups distributed "Collecting from the Uninsured: Hospital Billing Practices" which is a briefing paper from the National Conference of State Legislatures. He discussed a study that was done on Ohio's hospital pricing policies and the actions recommended as a result of the study. He stated that health care is a concern for all Americans. He noted the progress that has been made by the Task Force during the last two years.

The Task Force discussed action that should be taken on the report.

Rep. D. Clark indicated that the report of the consultant hired by the Task Force was clear that there was adequate competition in urban areas and limited competition in rural areas. He noted that there are inequities in the system. However, it is not the role of the Task Force to determine how health care is delivered. He agreed that transparency is an issue of concern. Rep. Clark stated the report staff prepared was adequate because it touched on all relevant parts of the work and study completed by the Task Force.

Rep. Lockhart felt the report should include a conclusion section of some type. The Legislature needs to know what the Task Force did.

**MOTION:** Sen. Hickman moved to adopt language from Option #3 as follows: "Although some healthcare systems have made efforts to change some of the perceived problems that precipitated the formation of the task force, there are issues in the Utah healthcare market that still exist. Issues related to patient choice, access to affordable care, and a level playing field for competition still persist in the view of many."

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION:** Rep. Last moved to adopt the following language from Option #3: "Although some healthcare systems have made efforts to change some of the perceived problems that precipitated the formation of the task force, issues related to patient choice, access to affordable care, and a level playing field for competition still persist in the view of some. The Task Force has no legislative recommendation." The substitute motion failed with Speaker Curtis, Rep. Dee, Rep. Dunnigan, Rep. Jones, Rep. Last, and Rep. Lockhart voting in the affirmative.

Rep. Lockhart suggested that the following statement be inserted at the beginning of Option #3: "Utah's health care market is complex with no easy answers to real or perceived problems."

Speaker Curtis asked Sen. Hickman if he would be willing to amend his motion by changing "many" to "some." Sen. Hickman indicated he would accept that recommendation as well as Rep. Lockhart's recommendation to the motion.

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION:** Rep. Dunnigan moved to adopt the following language: "Utah's health care market is complex with no easy answers to real or perceived problems. Although some healthcare systems have made efforts to change some of the perceived problems that precipitated the formation of the task force, issues related to patient choice, access to affordable care, and a level playing field for competition still persist in the view of some. The substitute motion failed with Rep. Biskupski, Rep. S. Clark, Speaker Curtis, Rep. Dee, Rep. Dunnigan, Rep. Jones, Rep. Last, and Rep. Lockhart voting in the affirmative.

The Task Force voted on Sen. Hickman's original motion which failed on a voice vote of the members.

Minutes of the Privately Owned Health Care Organization Task Force  
November 13, 2006  
Page 3

**MOTION:** Speaker Curtis moved to adopt the report as a base document. The motion failed in the Senate with Sen. Hickman voting in the affirmative.

### **3. Other Items / Adjourn**

**MOTION:** Speaker Curtis moved to adjourn. The motion passed.

Chair Waddoups adjourned the meeting at 2:55 p.m.